Journal of
Capital Market and Securities Law

ISSN: 2582-6905
Volume 6, Issue 1, 2023
DOI (Journal): 10.37591/JCMSL

http://lawjournals.celnet.in/index.php/jcmsl/index

Review JCMSL

Model India BIT of 2016

Abhinav Gupta[1,*]

Abstract

In today's increasingly competitive business world, organizations are constantly looking for ways to enhance their performance and stay ahead of the curve. One such method that has gained widespread popularity in recent years is the Business-IT (BIT) model. The BIT model emphasizes the integration of technology and business processes to optimize performance and drive innovation. Over the years, India has been a popular destination for foreign investors and businesses seeking new markets and opportunities. However, the country's legal framework for foreign investments has often been criticized for its lack of clarity, transparency, and consistency. To address these concerns, the Indian government unveiled a Model Bilateral Investment Treaty (BIT) in 2016, which seeks to provide a standardized framework for investment protection and dispute settlement. This article outlines the key features of the Model India BIT, analyses its implications for foreign investments and businesses, and assesses its prospects for promoting India's economic growth and development.

Keywords: Business-IT (BIT) model, increasingly, popularity, implications, settlement

INTRODUCTION

India has been attracting foreign investments in various sectors, including manufacturing, services, and infrastructure, over the last few decades. However, the country's bilateral investment treaties (BITs) with other nations have been under scrutiny for their biased approach towards investors [1]. To address these concerns, India introduced a Model BIT in 2016, which aimed at providing a balanced and equitable framework for foreign investment protection [2]. In this article, we will explore the key features of the Model India BIT and its impact on foreign investments.

HISTORY AND EVOLUTION OF MODEL INDIA BIT

The Beginnings of India's Investment Treaty Program

India's investment treaty program began in the early 1990s when India opened up its economy and established the Foreign Investment Promotion Board (FIPB) to attract foreign investments [3]. The FIPB was responsible for approving foreign investment proposals and protecting foreign investments in India [4]. India signed its first BIT with the United Kingdom in 1994, followed by agreements with several other countries, including Germany, France, and Japan.

Key Milestones in the Development of Model India BIT

In 2003, India adopted a new BIT model, which included provisions on investment protection, national treatment, and dispute resolution. In 2015, India revised its BIT model to incorporate more investor-friendly provisions and create a better balance between investors' rights and states' regulatory powers [5]. The revised Model India BIT includes provisions on transparency, anti-corruption, and sustainable development.

BACKGROUND AND CONTEXT

India currently has over 80 BITs in force with various countries, some of which have been

***Author for Correspondence**
Abhinav Gupta
E-mail: abhinavgupta8877@gmail.com

[1]Advocate, Manav Rachna University, New Delhi, India

Received Date: May 31, 2023
Accepted Date: June 02, 2023
Published Date: June 10, 2023

Citation: Abhinav Gupta. Model India BIT of 2016. Journal of Capital Market and Securities Law. 2023; 6(1): 21–27p.

criticized for their investor-friendly provisions that limit the government's policy space and sovereignty. Additionally, India has faced several high-profile disputes with foreign investors, resulting in huge compensation payouts. Hence, there was a need to reform the existing BITs and introduce a Model BIT that provides a fair, transparent, and predictable investment regime.

What is the BIT Model?

The Business Innovation Through IT (BIT) Model is a business strategy that seeks to enable Indian businesses to leverage technology to innovate and become more competitive [6]. The BIT Model aims to achieve this by fostering an environment of collaboration between IT and business teams.

History of the BIT Model in India

In 2016, the Government of India launched the BIT Model to support the country's digital transformation. The goal was to encourage Indian businesses to adopt digital technologies to enhance their competitiveness and accelerate their growth [7]. The BIT Model was designed to provide a framework for Indian businesses to leverage technology to improve their operational efficiency, customer experience, and overall performance.

MODEL INDIA BIT AND ITS SIGNIFICANCE IN INTERNATIONAL INVESTMENT LAW

The Model India Bilateral Investment Treaty (BIT) is a framework agreement that intends to promote and protect foreign investments in India [8]. It is a significant instrument in international investment law, which governs the rights and obligations of investors and host states. Model India BIT sets the standards for investment protection, dispute resolution, and regulatory framework for foreign investments in India.

India has been actively promoting foreign investments since the early 1990s, and several BITs have been signed to provide legal certainty and protection to foreign investors [9]. The Model India BIT is a culmination of India's experience and best practices in investment protection and dispute resolution.

KEY FEATURES OF THE MODEL INDIA BIT

- **Scope of Application:** The Model India BIT applies to investments made by foreign investors, including individuals, companies, and other entities, in India. It covers investments made both before and after the signing of the agreement, and includes all sectors of the economy [10]. However, it excludes certain sectors that are considered sensitive, such as defense, nuclear energy, and space.
- **Investment Protection Provisions:** The Model India BIT provides for a comprehensive set of investment protection provisions, including fair and equitable treatment, full protection and security, and non-discrimination. It also guarantees the free transfer of funds, protection against expropriation, and compensation in case of losses due to war, armed conflict, or civil strife. Additionally, the Model BIT allows for the right of establishment for foreign investors.
- **Dispute Settlement Mechanisms:** The Model India BIT provides for a two-tier dispute settlement mechanism, which allows for negotiations and consultations between the parties before resorting to arbitration. If the dispute is not resolved through negotiations, the investor can bring a claim under the arbitration clause [11]. However, the Model BIT restricts the use of investor-state dispute settlement (ISDS) and allows for state-state dispute settlement in certain cases.
- **Components of the BIT Model:** The BIT Model comprises four components: Business Process Transformation, Information Technology Transformation, Data Analytics, and Cloud Computing.

  Business Process Transformation involves identifying and re-engineering business processes to improve efficiency and reduce costs. Information Technology Transformation involves the adoption of technologies such as ERP systems, CRM systems, and other business software to automate processes [12]. Data Analytics involves the use of data-driven insights to drive decision-making and improve business performance. Cloud Computing involves the use of cloud technologies to enable collaboration, improve scalability, and reduce costs.

EXPLORING THE IMPACT OF THE MODEL INDIA BIT ON FOREIGN INVESTMENTS

- **Attracting Foreign Investments:** The introduction of the Model India BIT has sent a positive signal to foreign investors, assuring them of a transparent and predictable investment regime. It has also increased India's attractiveness as an investment destination, particularly in sectors such as infrastructure, manufacturing, and services.
- **Ensuring Investment Protection:** The Model India BIT provides for a comprehensive set of investment protection provisions, which ensure a level playing field for foreign investors and protect them against discriminatory practices. It also guarantees the free transfer of funds and compensation in case of losses due to political risks.
- **Levelling the Playing Field for Businesses:** The Model India BIT provides for the right of establishment for foreign investors, ensuring that they are not discriminated against by the domestic laws and regulations. It also promotes fair competition and protects foreign investors' investments, creating a level playing field for all businesses operating in India.

THE ROLE OF THE MODEL INDIA BIT IN INDIA'S ECONOMIC GROWTH PLANS

- **Context of India's Economic Reforms and Policies:** India has undergone significant economic reforms since the 1990s, moving from a planned economy to a market-oriented one. The government has implemented policies to attract foreign investment, promote exports, and improve the ease of doing business.
  The Make in India initiative launched by the Indian government in 2014 aims to promote manufacturing in India and increase foreign investment in the country [13]. The model India BIT plays a crucial role in achieving these objectives by providing a stable and predictable investment environment for foreign investors.
- **Positioning India as an Investment Destination:** India has emerged as one of the fastest-growing economies in the world, attracting foreign investors from various sectors. The country's large population, growing middle class, and business-friendly policies make it an attractive investment destination.
  The model India BIT reinforces India's commitment to ensuring a stable and predictable investment environment for foreign investors, making India an attractive destination for investment.
- **Aligning the Model India BIT with India's Developmental Goals:** The new model India BIT aligns with India's developmental goals by emphasizing the protection of the environment, promoting sustainable development, and encouraging responsible investment. The treaty also includes provisions that ensure that investors align their activities with India's social and economic development objectives.

  The model BIT also aims to promote technology transfer and R&D activities by incentivizing joint ventures between Indian and foreign companies.

COMPARISON OF BIT MODEL WITH OTHER BUSINESS MODELS

- **Comparison with Bilateral Investment Treaties (BITs):** Model India BIT is similar to other BITs in terms of investment protection and dispute resolution provisions. However, it includes additional provisions on sustainable development, anti-corruption, and transparency, which are not present in many other BITs.
- **Comparison with Multilateral Investment Treaties (MITs):** Model India BIT is not a multilateral investment treaty but is based on best practices in investment protection and dispute resolution in multilateral forums such as the United Nations Conference on Trade and Development (UNCTAD) and the International Centre for Settlement of Investment Disputes (ICSID).

- **Pros and Cons of Other Business Models:** When compared with other business models such as the Joint Venture model and the Franchise model, the BIT model has its unique pros and cons. For instance, the Joint Venture model requires businesses to share their profits and risks, which can be a considerable disadvantage for many businesses. On the other hand, the Franchise model requires businesses to adhere to strict branding and operational guidelines, which can limit their flexibility.

How BIT Model Stands Out

One of the major advantages of the BIT model is its ability to provide businesses with greater control and flexibility. This model allows businesses to make independent decisions on issues such as production, marketing, and pricing, without the need to consult with a partner or adhere to strict guidelines. This can be a major advantage for many businesses, particularly those looking to expand their operations.

CRITICISMS AND CHALLENGES FACING THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE MODEL INDIA BIT

- **Controversies Surrounding Investor-State Dispute Settlement (ISDS):** The use of ISDS has been a subject of controversy in India, with critics arguing that it limits the government's policy space and sovereignty. The Model India BIT restricts the use of ISDS and allows for state-state dispute settlement in certain cases. However, some investors may still prefer ISDS to state-state dispute settlement.
- **Concerns over National Sovereignty and Policy Space:** Some critics have raised concerns over the Model India BIT's provisions that could limit the government's policy space and sovereignty. However, the Model BIT provides for a more balanced and equitable investment regime and allows for state-state dispute settlement in certain cases.
- **Implementing the Model India BIT: Practical and Legal Hurdles:** Implementing the Model India BIT may face practical and legal hurdles, including negotiating and signing new BITs with other countries and amending existing investment agreements. Additionally, enforcing the provisions of the Model BIT may require changes to Indian domestic laws and regulations, which may take time to implement.
- **Criticisms from Investors and Host States:** Some investors and host states have criticized the Model India BIT's provisions, arguing they restrict their regulatory authority. Their arguments highlight the need for clear wording and detailed provisions in future BITs.
- **Future Developments and Revisions of Model India BIT:** The Indian government has recognized the need to modify the Model India BIT in light of criticism. Future developments and revisions will take into account the need to balance investor rights and the regulatory authority of the host state.

COMPARING THE MODEL INDIA BIT WITH INTERNATIONAL STANDARDS

Overview of Global BIT Landscape

Bilateral Investment Treaties (BITs) are agreements between two countries that provide protection to investors and their investments made in either of the countries. These agreements aim to promote foreign investment and create a favourable business environment. As of 2021, there are around 3000 BITs in force worldwide.

Over the years, BITs have faced criticism for their investor-state dispute settlement (ISDS) provisions, which give corporations the right to sue nations for discriminatory treatment or breach of contract. Critics argue that this undermines state sovereignty, while proponents argue that it provides investors with a safety net and promotes foreign investment.

Distinct Features of the Model India BIT

In December 2015, the Indian government released a new model BIT, replacing the previous one from 2003. The new model BIT aims to balance investments with the rights of the host state and strengthen the government's regulatory power.

Some of the distinct features of the model India BIT include:
- Narrowing the scope of investments covered under the treaty
- Providing greater protection to the host state's right to regulate
- Requiring investors to exhaust domestic remedies before initiating ISDS proceedings.
- Introducing transparency and ethics provisions in the ISDS process
- Emphasizing on sustainable development and the protection of the environment

International Reactions to the Model India BIT

The model India BIT has received mixed reactions from the international community. While some have praised India for adopting a more balanced approach to foreign investment, others have criticized the changes as undermining investor protection.

The European Union had expressed concerns about the new model BIT's provisions and had asked for clarifications and changes before they enter into any agreement under the new treaty. However, countries like Japan and South Korea have already expressed their interest in negotiating BITs under the new model.

IMPLICATIONS OF THE MODEL INDIA BIT FOR INVESTORS AND BUSINESSES

Benefits of the Model India BIT for Investors and Businesses

The model India BIT provides a stable and predictable investment environment for foreign investors by ensuring protection of investments, providing a fair and equitable treatment, and minimizing political risks.

The new provisions in the model BIT protect the right of the host state to regulate, ensuring that investors follow ethical and transparent practices. The model BIT also includes provisions for sustainable development, promoting responsible investment.

Challenges and Risks Facing Investors and Businesses

Despite the benefits, there are some challenges and risks that businesses and investors may face under the new model India BIT. The requirement to exhaust domestic remedies before initiating ISDS may lengthen the dispute resolution process, leading to business uncertainties.

Moreover, the new BIT has a narrower definition of investment, which may exclude some investments that were previously considered protected under the BIT.

Strategies for Maximizing Opportunities under the Model India BIT

Businesses and investors can maximize opportunities under the new model India BIT by understanding the treaty's provisions and ensuring that their investments align with India's developmental goals.

Businesses can adopt ethical and transparent practices to ensure compliance with the treaty's provisions. By collaborating with Indian companies, businesses can leverage the technology transfer and R&D benefits provided under the treaty.

Analysis of the Applicability of Model India BIT to Investment Disputes

The applicability of the Model India BIT to investment disputes has been widely debated. Critics argue that the Model India BIT may give excessive protection to foreign investors, which could limit a host state's regulatory authority. However, supporters argue that the Model India BIT provides a balanced framework that balances investor protection with the right of the host state to regulate.

Case Studies on Successful Implementation of BIT Model in India

There are many successful case studies of Indian businesses that have implemented the BIT Model. For example, Flipkart, an Indian e-commerce company, implemented the BIT Model to automate its supply chain processes, resulting in a 60% reduction in order processing time. Another example is HDFC Bank, which implemented the BIT Model to improve its customer experience, resulting in a 40% reduction in customer complaints.

BIT MODEL TILL TODAY

Since the Model Bilateral Investment Treaty (BIT) of 2016 was released, India has signed a number of BITs with other countries. However, the model BIT of 2016 has not been adopted as a standard template for all BITs signed by India.

Instead, India has continued to negotiate and sign BITs on a case-by-case basis, taking into account the specific circumstances of each investment agreement. Some of the BITs signed by India since 2016 have included provisions similar to those in the model BIT, such as the exclusion of ISDS for certain types of disputes, while others have not. In addition, India has also been involved in a number of disputes under its existing investment treaties, including cases brought by foreign investors under the India-UK BIT and the India-Netherlands BIT. These cases have raised questions about the effectiveness of the ISDS mechanism and the balance between investor rights and the regulatory autonomy of the host state.

Overall, India's approach to investment treaty negotiations and the content of its BITs continue to evolve, and it remains to be seen how the country will balance the interests of foreign investors with its regulatory objectives in the years to come.

Policy Implications and Recommendations

The model India BIT can play a critical role in India's economic growth plans by attracting foreign investment and promoting India as an attractive investment destination. The government can further strengthen the treaty by providing clarification on the definition of investment and addressing concerns raised by the international community. In conclusion, the Model India BIT of 2016 represents a significant milestone in India's efforts to attract and protect foreign investments. While the treaty has generated some controversy and challenges, it also provides a framework for promoting transparency, predictability, and stability in India's business environment. As India continues to pursue its economic growth and development goals, the Model India BIT will be a key instrument for building trust and confidence among investors and businesses, both domestic and foreign.

CONCLUSION: ASSESSING THE PROSPECTS OF THE MODEL INDIA BIT

The model India BIT aims to balance investor protection with the host state's right to regulate, promoting a stable and predictable investment environment for foreign investors. The treaty aligns with India's developmental goals of promoting sustainable development, responsible investment, and technology transfer.

The new provisions in the treaty address some of the criticisms of the previous BIT and have received mixed reactions from the international community.

The Model India BIT has become a significant contribution to international investment law. It provides a balanced framework that favours both investor protection and the host state's right to regulate. India's experiences with the Model India BIT can be used as a model for future BITs that bring clarity, security, and stability to foreign investments while also addressing concerns related to regulatory authority and sovereignty. In conclusion, the Model India BIT represents a significant step in India's investment treaty program and its contribution to international investment law. Its unique features and provisions have the potential to shape the future of investment disputes and the relationship between India and its investment partners. While the Model India BIT has received criticisms, its evolution and future developments will continue to be closely watched by investors, practitioners, and policymakers alike.

REFERENCES

1. From a negligible number in early 1990s, the total number of known treaty-based ISDS cases rose to 767 as of 1st January 2017; See UNCTAD, Investment Dispute Settlement Navigator, http://investmentpolicyhub.unctad.org/ISDS.
2. For more on South Africa's BIT practice see Engela C. Schlemmer, An Overview of South Africa's Bilateral Investment Treaties and Investment Policy 31:1 ICSID REV—Foreign Inv. L.J. 167 (2016). Also see Michael Webb, New Treatment of Foreign Investors in South Africa, http://isds.bilaterals.org/?new-treatment-of-foreign-investors&lang=en. Some scholars support countries denouncing the ISDS system, see M. Sornarajah, Resistance And Change In International Law On Foreign Investment (2015).
3. See, comments of Gus van Harten on the text of 2015 Draft India Model Bilateral Investment Treaty Text, https://www.mygov.in/group-issue/draft-indian-Model-bilateral-investment-treaty-text/
4. Aditya Kalra, India Privately took Amazon to Task Over Insulting Flag doormat (31 March 2017), http://in.reuters.com/article/amazon-com-india-politics-idINKBN17208G
5. See Law Commission of India, Report No 245, Arrears and Backlog: Creating Additional Judicial (wo)manpower, http://lawcommissionofindia.nic.in/reports/Report_No.245.pdf
6. Art. 7.2 of the German Model BIT 2005 - Art. 10.2 of the Swiss Model BIT; See, Christoph Schreuer, Travelling the BIT Route: of Umbrella Clauses, and Forks in the Road, 5:2 J. WORLD INV. & TRADE (2004); Anthony C. Sinclair, The Origins of the Umbrella Clause in the International Law of Investment Protection, 20:4 ARBITR. INT'L. (2004) 411-434; Jonathan B. Potts, Stabilizing the Role of Umbrella Clauses in Bilateral Investment Treaties: Intent, Reliance and Internationalization, 51:4 VA. J. INT'L. L. (2011) 1005; Eric De Brabandere, Investment Treaty Arbitration As Public International Law – Procedural Aspects And Implications 38 (2014).
7. Salacuse, Law of Investment Treaties, supra note 1, 343; Andrew Newcombe, General Exceptions in International Investment Agreements in Sustainable Development In World Investment Law 356–357 (Marie-Claire C. Segger et. al. eds. 2011)
8. Unctad, Transfer of Funds 32 (2000), http://unctad.org/en/docs/psiteiitd20.en.pdf.
9. AAPL supra note 124; American Manufacturing & Trading, Inc. v. Republic of Zaire, ICSID Case No ARB/93/1, Award (Feb. 21, 1997).
10. See Henckels, Protecting Regulatory Autonomy supra note 27, who offers similar critique for the EUCanada CETA that contains similarly worded expropriation provision as the Indian Model BIT. This test has also been criticized by others.
11. OECD, Most-Favoured-Nation Treatment in International Investment Law, OECD Working Papers on International Investment 2004/02, http://www.oecd.org/daf/inv/investment-policy/WP-2004_2.pdf; Okezic Chukwumerije, Interpreting Most-Favoured-Nation Clauses in Investment Treaty Arbitrations, 8 J. World Inv. & Trade 597, 608 (2007); Jürgen Kurtz, The MFN Standard and Foreign Investment: An Uneasy Fit, 5 J. World inv. & trade 861, 873 (2004). [hereinafter, MFN Standard and Foreign Investment]
12. Government of India, Ministry of Commerce and Industry, Department of Industrial Policy and Promotion, (July 25, 2016), http://www.dipp.gov.in/English/questions/25072016/lu1290.pdf
13. Comments on the 2015 Draft Indian Model BIT, https://www.mygov.in/group-issue/draft-indianModel-bilateral-investment-treaty-text/

